



## The Evolution of Russian Political Tactics in Ukraine

Ihor Hurak & Paul D'Anieri

To cite this article: Ihor Hurak & Paul D'Anieri (2022) The Evolution of Russian Political Tactics in Ukraine, *Problems of Post-Communism*, 69:2, 121-132, DOI: [10.1080/10758216.2020.1819162](https://doi.org/10.1080/10758216.2020.1819162)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/10758216.2020.1819162>



Published online: 01 Oct 2020.



Submit your article to this journal



Article views: 635



View related articles



View Crossmark data



Citing articles: 1 View citing articles



## The Evolution of Russian Political Tactics in Ukraine

Ihor Hurak<sup>a</sup> and Paul D'Anieri<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of International Relations, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Ivano-Frankivsk, Ukraine; <sup>b</sup>Department of Political Science and School of Public Policy, University of California, Riverside, CA, USA

### ABSTRACT

The conflict in Donbas has distracted attention from broader patterns of interaction between Russia and Ukraine. Russia continues to use a variety of tactics, apart from military force, to influence Ukraine. Among the key tactics are coercion in the gas sector, naval blockade, “passport colonialism,” attempts to sway Ukrainian elections, support for the pro-Russian politician Viktor Medvedchuk, and promotion of religious influence through the Russian Orthodox Church. None of these tactics is novel, but each is evolving along with circumstances. Regardless of what happens in Donbas, Ukraine will continue to feel multifaceted pressure from Russia.

### Introduction

While the conflict in Donbas is the most important means by which Russia seeks to shape Ukrainian politics and foreign policy, it is far from the only one. A broader array of Russian tactics existed before 2014 and has persisted in complement with the military conflict. It is important, therefore, to examine the Russia–Ukraine conflict in the broader context of all these interactions. This article asks three related questions. First, what tactics is Russia using to influence Ukraine beyond the conflict in the Donbas and the annexation of Crimea? Second, how have these tactics changed since 2014? Third, what do these tactics tell us about Russia’s aims? The main body of the paper addresses the first two questions. We return to the third in the conclusion.<sup>1</sup>

The importance of these questions was demonstrated on January 25, 2020, when supervision of Russia’s policy toward Ukraine was shifted from Vladislav Surkov to Dmitry Kozak. Given Surkov’s notoriety as an architect of the doctrine of “sovereign democracy,” and his reputation as a sower of chaos, his removal led to speculation that Vladimir Putin was initiating a change in policy toward Ukraine. The hope is that Kozak, who appears to be more concerned with the economic cost of the ongoing conflict, will be amenable to a more flexible interpretation of the Minsk agreements (Stanovaya 2019).

This raises the question of just what Russia’s policy toward Ukraine is. If a change is underway, is it a change of goals, of strategy, or of tactics? Before we can address such questions, we need to more clearly understand Russia’s policies in Ukraine in recent years. Russia has deployed a range of methods for shaping both the options open to Ukrainian leaders and the choices they make. Some of these, such as using Ukraine’s energy dependence, have a history going back to the early post-Soviet years, but are now changing. Others,

such as restricting navigation in the Sea of Azov, have increased dramatically since 2014. In the sections that follow, we address six tactics in particular: coercion using energy supplies; seizing control of maritime approaches to Ukraine; extending Russian passports and citizenship to Ukrainian citizens; influencing elections; promoting the pro-Russian oligarch Viktor Medvedchuk; and deploying the Russian Orthodox Church to promote Russian–Ukrainian unity. We stress that this list is not exhaustive. Russia engages in a variety of “active measures,” many of which are designed to make attribution difficult. Without denying the importance of these tactics, this article focuses on some actions that, because of their lower intensity, may escape attention, even though they are pervasive. (Abrams 2016; Kuzio and D’Anieri 2018; Radin, Demus, and Marcinek 2020)

For a variety of reasons, Russia seeks to control Ukraine (D’Anieri 2019; Shevtsova 2014). However, even the most pro-Russian Ukrainian presidents, Viktor Yanukovych (2010–2014) and Leonid Kuchma (1994–2004), resisted Russia’s integration proposals. Moreover, since 2014, Ukrainian ruling elites have pursued only Western-oriented integration projects. In December 2014, Ukraine’s Verkhovna Rada (parliament) abolished Ukraine’s nonaligned status. In February 2019, the Rada amended Ukraine’s constitution to make European Union (EU) and NATO membership official goals. (Zminy do Konstytutsii pro kurs Ukrayiny na YeS i NATO nabuly chynnosti 2019)

Meanwhile, in November 2016, Vladimir Putin approved the current Foreign Policy Concept of the Russian Federation, which advocates the deployment of “soft power.” “In addition to traditional methods of diplomacy, ‘soft power’ has become an integral part of efforts to achieve foreign policy objectives.

administration threatened long-term Russian goals in Ukraine, even as Russia gained control of Crimea and developed a powerful lever in the form of a conflict that it could escalate at any time. While that conflict, and the potential for resolving it, has received immense attention, Russia has maintained and refined an array of tactics that largely predate the events of 2014. Among the key tactics Russia has continued to deploy are coercion in the gas sector, naval blockade of the Azov coast, “passport colonialism,” attempts to sway Ukrainian elections, promotion of the pro-Russian politician Viktor Medvedchuk, and the use of the Russian Orthodox Church to influence Ukrainians. None of these tactics is novel, but each is evolving along with circumstances, and an important question for the future is how effective these tools will be and how Russia might further modify them.

What do these tactics tell us about Russia’s goals and strategies in Ukraine? Four conclusions emerge from this analysis. First, Russia is not satisfied with the current status quo, but rather seeks to further expand its influence in Ukraine and over the Ukrainian government. Second, the tactics on display are consistent with a range of Russian goals, from the somewhat limited to the very extensive. Third, while these tactics may represent a coherent strategy, they might also represent an approach that is more opportunistic. Finally, based on the exposition of tactics in this article, there is not much sign of a change in either strategy or tactics since Putin’s appointment of Dmitry Kozak.

Much of the discussion about the conflict between Ukraine and Russia, and about possible solutions, has concerned Russia’s aims. This is a crucial question, because many proposed Western policies depend on assumptions about Russian goals. If Russia’s goals are entirely defensive, then making concessions in Ukraine might usher in an era of stability. If its goals are more expansive, then concessions are less likely to solve the problem.<sup>7</sup>

What outcomes would Russia be satisfied with? Judging by the tactics analyzed in this article, Russia’s aims are not as minimalist and defensive as some analysts have suggested (e.g. just keeping Ukraine out of NATO). Instead, it appears that Russia continues to seek, at a minimum, a dominant relationship with Ukraine, and perhaps reintegration on Russian terms. This is evidenced not only by Putin’s oft-repeated statements about the unity of the two peoples and the claims of the Russian Orthodox Church, but also by the fact that the replacement of the pro-Western Petro Poroshenko by the much more balanced Vladimir Zelensky did not significantly alter Russia’s behavior. Rather than being satisfied with the looming victory of Zelensky’s “Sluha Narodu” party in the parliamentary elections, Russia promoted the new party formed by the ardently pro-Russian Viktor Medvedchuk.

While the evidence indicates that Russia’s motives are not minimal, it does not show clearly how far they reach. Would Russia be satisfied with a rejection of the EU Association Agreement? With Ukrainian neutrality or “Finlandization”? With Ukraine agreeing to economically integrate with Russia? Or does Russia seek further territorial aggrandizement in Ukraine? The tactics we have documented do not resolve these questions.

When we examine the tactics Russia has deployed since 2014, apart from the conflict in Donbas, two things stand out. The first is continuity over time. With the exception of Russia’s actions in the Sea of Azov, which had less precedent, the other behaviors described here resemble efforts Russia has pursued in Ukraine and elsewhere throughout the post-Soviet era. Gas cutoffs and the promise of cheap gas in return for political concessions emerged in the early 1990s, as did claims that Russia had the right to intervene on behalf of Russian citizens in other countries, issuing passports to other countries’ citizens, promotion of pro-Russian politicians, and the broader narrative that the separation of Ukraine from Russia was artificial. Similarly, the deployment of Orthodoxy to legitimize Russian territorial claims has a long history.

A second defining feature is the wide range of tactics being used, which include economics, religion, elections, and media, as well as various blends, all backed by the threat or use of force. The strategy, therefore, seems to be to apply as much pressure across as many fronts as possible. Rather than being based on the idea that any individual tactic will lead to clearly predictable results, the approach seems to be that applying broad pressure patiently over time is bound to lead to positive results.

It may well be that Russia’s ultimate goals in Ukraine are not clearly defined, and that the tactics we see have endured over time because they are flexible, low-cost means of increasing Russia’s influence, regardless of the ultimate goal. In this interpretation, Russia is sensitive to costs and will be opportunistic, rather than pursuing clearly defined objectives without regard to cost. This is consistent with an interpretation of the events of 2014 that sees Russia acting as it did because the chaos created by the Revolution of Dignity allowed it to seize Crimea and much of Donbas at low cost.

At the outset, we raised the question of whether the appointment of new leadership over Russia’s operations in Ukraine might lead to tactical or strategic change. So far, there is little sign of either changing markedly. As the six issues we have covered indicate, there is considerable continuity in Russia’s nonmilitary tactics prior to and since 2014. Nor is there much sign that Russia’s ultimate goals in Ukraine have changed, even acknowledging that there is no agreement on what those goals are. What then does the replacement of Vladislav Surkov by Dmitry Kozak signify? It is not clear. One possible interpretation is that the change represents the hope of getting the intended results without dramatically changing tactics. Perhaps more skilled use of the same tools will lead to better results. Alternatively, one might argue that the change represents a desire to tinker with the tactics, but not to change them dramatically.

This analysis highlights the pressure that Russia continues to put on Ukraine. Even if the conflict in Donbas were somehow stabilized, Ukraine will still face increasing challenges. Two that loom especially large, based on this analysis, are the local elections in Ukraine scheduled for October 25, 2020, and future gas transshipment issues. While local elections in Ukraine gain less attention than national ones, their significance is growing due to the decentralization that has resulted in part from Russian intervention. We can expect Russian interference in these elections to be widespread and systematic.

Moreover, the long-running saga of energy coercion will change dramatically in Russia's favor if and when the pipelines circumventing Ukraine finally come on line. This will disrupt the correlation of energy forces that has been more or less consistent since 1991. Ukraine will lose both a major source of hard currency earnings and its most powerful lever against Russian energy coercion. For all these reasons, understanding Ukraine's relations with Russia requires focusing on issues well beyond the conflicts over Crimea and Donbas.

## Notes

1. Many studies of Russian foreign policy focus on the concept of "soft power" to describe nonmilitary means of influence. We find that coercion, attraction, and subversion are so thoroughly intertwined that trying to label them as "soft" or "hard" would cause as many problems as it resolves. For a nuanced discussion of "soft power" in the Russia–Ukraine relationship, see Feklyunina (2016).
2. Igor Guzhva is a Ukrainian pro-Russian journalist who has lived in Russia for some time, and has at various times been the editor-in-chief of the political expert network of the Kreml.org project and the editor-in-chief of *Moscow News*.
3. Fifty percent of ZIK's shares are owned by Russia's Gazprom.
4. Quoted in Ukraine Election Task Force, "Foreign Interference in Ukraine's Democracy," 3.
5. Ukraine Election Task Force, "Foreign Interference in Ukraine's Democracy," 6.
6. The Opposition Bloc had been formed to run in the 2014 parliamentary elections as a successor to the Party of Regions. It split in 2018, with a faction under Oleksandr Vilkul retaining the "Opposition Bloc" name and fielding its own candidates.
7. The relationship between Russia's motives, policy solutions, and variants of realist international relations theories is explored in Paul D'Anieri, "Magical Realism: Assumptions, Evidence and Prescriptions in the Ukraine Conflict," *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 60, 1 (2019): 97–117.

## Disclosure Statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

## References

- Abrams, Steve. 2016. "Beyond Propaganda: Soviet Active Measures in Putin's Russia." *Connections: The Quarterly Journal* 15 (1):5–31. doi:10.11610/Connections.15.1.01.
- "Aleksandr Novak: 'Severnyi potok—2' budet postroen do kontsa 2019 g." 2019. *Terminal*, March 7. <http://oilreview.kiev.ua/2019/03/07/aleksandr-novak-severnyj-potok-2-budet-postroen-do-konca-2019g/>.
- Antonenko, Anton, R. Nitsovych, O. Pavlenko, and K. Takac. 2018. "Reforming Ukraine's Energy Sector: Critical Unfinished Business." *Carnegie Europe*, February. <https://carnegieeurope.eu/2018/02/06/reforming-ukraine-s-energy-sector-critical-unfinished-business-pub-75449>.
- Baliuk, Nataliia. 2019. "My yikh zhaliemo." *Vysokyi Zamok*, March 20. <https://wz.lviv.ua/article/387068-my-ikh-zhaliemo>
- Balmaceda, Margarita M. 2015. *Politics of Energy Dependency: Ukraine, Belarus, and Lithuania between Domestic Oligarchs and Russian Pressure*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- "Boiko ta Medvedchuk poikhaly na perehovory v Moskvu." 2019. *Novynarnya*, March 22. <https://novynarnia.com/2019/03/22/perego-vori-v-moskvu/>.
- "Boiko ta Medvedchuk zustrilysia z holovoju 'Hazpromu' v Rosii." 2019. *Radio Svoboda*, June 6. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/news-boyko-medvedchuk-rosija/29986543.html>.
- Burdyha, Ihor. 2018. "Ukrainski viiskovi v Azovskomu mori: nerivnyi balans syl." *Deutsche Welle*, November 27. <https://www.dw.com/uk/українські-військові-в-азовському-морі-нерівний-баланс-сил/a-46466351>.
- Burkovskyi, Petro. 2019a. "Reeksport rosiiskoi propahandy: napriamky." *Media Sapiens*, April 24. [https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy\\_and\\_influence/reeksport\\_rosiyskoi\\_propagandi\\_napryamki/](https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy_and_influence/reeksport_rosiyskoi_propagandi_napryamki/)
- Burkovskyi, Petro. 2019b. "Zelenskyi, tak Zelenskyi ... Ohliad pronyknennia rosiiskoi propahandy u ukrainskyi informatsiinyi prostir u travni 2019 roku." *Media Sapiens*, June 17. [https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy\\_and\\_influence/zelenskiy\\_tak\\_zelenskiy/](https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy_and_influence/zelenskiy_tak_zelenskiy/)
- Burkovskyi, Petro. 2019c. "Putin pratsiuje na Medvedchuka, telekanaly Medvedchuka – na Putina. Ohliad pronyknennia rosiiskoi propahandy v ukrainsky media v chervni 2019 roku." *Media Sapiens*, August 2. [https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy\\_and\\_influence/putin\\_pratsyue\\_na\\_medvedchuka\\_telekanali\\_medvedchuka\\_na\\_putina\\_oglyad\\_proniknennya\\_rosiyskoi\\_propagandi\\_v\\_ukrainsky\\_media\\_v\\_chervni\\_2019\\_roku/](https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy_and_influence/putin_pratsyue_na_medvedchuka_telekanali_medvedchuka_na_putina_oglyad_proniknennya_rosiyskoi_propagandi_v_ukrainsky_media_v_chervni_2019_roku/).
- Burkovskyi, Petro. 2019d. "Nartsysyzm Medvedchuka zavazhaie rosiiskii propahandi. Ohliad pronyknennia kremlivskoi propahandy v ukrainsky mediaprostir u lypni 2019 roku." *Media Sapiens*, August 30. [https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy\\_and\\_influence/nartsisizm\\_medvedchuka\\_zavazhae\\_rosiyskiy\\_propagandi\\_oglyad\\_proniknennya\\_kremlivskoi\\_propagandi\\_v\\_ukrainsky\\_media\\_prostir\\_u\\_lipni\\_2019\\_roku/](https://ms.detector.media/monitoring/advocacy_and_influence/nartsisizm_medvedchuka_zavazhae_rosiyskiy_propagandi_oglyad_proniknennya_kremlivskoi_propagandi_v_ukrainsky_media_prostir_u_lipni_2019_roku/).
- Chabarai, Hanna. 2019. "Shcho robty z Donbasom nastupnomu prezidentu (doslidzhennia)." *Tyzhden'*, Accessed April 29. <https://tyzden.ua/Politics/229715>.
- D'Anieri, Paul. 1999. *Economic Interdependence in Ukrainian–Russian Relations*, Chapter 4. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- D'Anieri, Paul. 2019. *Ukraine and Russia: From Civilized Divorce to Uncivil War*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- "Direct Line with Vladimir Putin." 2017. June 15. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/54790>.
- "Direct Line with Vladimir Putin." 2018. June 7. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/57692>.
- "Direct Line with Vladimir Putin." 2019. June 20. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/60795>.
- "Dii Rosii v akvatorii Azovskoho moria ne maiut nichoho spilnoho z morskym pravom—ekspert." 2018. *Dyyys'*, August 17. <https://dyys.info/2018/08/17/diyi-rosiyyi-v-akvatoriyyi-azovskogo-morya-ne-mayut-nichogo-spilnogo-z-morskym-pravom-ekspert/>.
- European Parliament. 2018. "MEPs Commend Ukraine's Reform Efforts and Denounce Russian Aggression." December 12. <https://www.europarl.europa.eu/news/en/press-room/20181205IPR20940/meps-commend-ukraine-s-reform-efforts-and-denounce-russian-aggression>.
- "European Parliament Resolution of 25 October 2018 on the Situation in the Sea of Azov 2018/2870 (RSP)." 2018. [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2018-0435\\_EN.html](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2018-0435_EN.html).
- "Executive Order Identifying Groups of Persons Entitled to a Fast-Track Procedure When Applying for Russian Citizenship on Humanitarian Grounds." 2019. April 24. <http://en.kremlin.ru/acts/news/60358>.
- "Executive Order on Certain Categories of Foreign Citizens and Stateless Persons Entitled to Fast-Track Procedure When Applying for Russian Citizenship." 2019. May 1. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/60429>.
- Feklyunina, Valentina. 2016. "Soft Power and Identity: Russia Ukraine and the 'Russian World(s)'." *European Journal of International Relations* 22 (4):773–96. doi:10.1177/1354066115601200.
- Foreign Policy Concept of the Russian Federation. 2016. December 1. [https://www.mid.ru/en/foreign\\_policy/official\\_documents/-/asset\\_publisher/CptICkB6BZ29/content/id/2542248](https://www.mid.ru/en/foreign_policy/official_documents/-/asset_publisher/CptICkB6BZ29/content/id/2542248).
- "Gazprom" sorval import gaza v Ukrainu za 15 minut do nachala postavok. 2018. March 2. <https://www.segodnya.ua/economics/enews/gazprom-sorval-import-gaza-v-ukrainu-za-15-minut-do-nachala-postavok-1119069.html>.
- Gala Sklyarevskaya. 2016. "Igor Guzhva rasskazal, na chi dengi zapustil novyi proekt." *Detektor*, February 16. <https://detector.media/rinok/>

- [article/112849/2016-02-16-igor-guzhva-rasskazal-na-chi-dengi-zapustil-novyi-proekt/](https://tsn.ua/groshi/gazprom-ologosiv-pro-rozirvannya-vsih-kontraktiv-z-ukrayinoyu-1118172.html).
- Gorham, Michael S. 2019. "When Soft Power Hardens: The Formation and Fracturing of Putin's 'Russian World.'" In *Global Russian Cultures*, edited by Kevin M. F. Platt, 185–206. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.
- "Hazprom" oholosyy pro rozirvannya vsikh kontraktiv z Ukrainoiu. 2018. March 2. <https://tsn.ua/groshi/gazprom-ologosiv-pro-rozirvannya-vsih-kontraktiv-z-ukrayinoyu-1118172.html>.
- "Hazovi perehovory Ukraina-Rosia-Yes: Shefchovych zaivyv pro uspikh pershoho raundu." 2018. *Ukrinform*, July 17. <https://www.ukrinform.ua/rubric-economy/2500633-gazovi-peregovori-ukrainarosiae-sefcovic-zaaviv-pro-uspih-persogo-raundu.html>.
- "Hazprom' zirvav tehnichniy trystoroni perehovory z Ukrainoiu ta Yes shchodo postachannia hazu." 2019. *Yevropeis'ka Pravda*, January 15. <https://www.eurointegration.com.ua/news/2019/01/15/7091573/>.
- Khrennikova, Dina, Anna Shiryayevskaya, and Daryna Krasnolutska. 2019. "Why the Russia-Ukraine Gas Dispute Worries Europe." *Bloomberg.com*, December 6. <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-12-06/why-the-russia-ukraine-gas-dispute-worries-europe-quicktake>.
- Kulyk, Volodymyr. 2016. "National Identity in Ukraine: Impact of Euromaidan and the War." *Europe-Asia Studies* 68 (4):588–608. doi:10.1080/09668136.2016.1174980.
- Kuzio, Taras. 2005. "Russian Policy Towards Ukraine during Elections." *Demokratizatsia* 13 (4):498–99.
- Kuzio, Taras, and Paul D'Anieri. 2018. *The Sources of Russia's Great Power Politics: Ukraine and the Challenge to the European Order*. Bristol, UK: E-International Relations Publishing.
- Lavrov, Sergey. 2010. "The Message of Sergey Lavrov, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Russia, to the Holy Synod of the Russian Orthodox Church over the Death of Patriarch Alexy II of Moscow and All Russia," quoted in Daniel P. Payne, "Spiritual Security, the Russian Orthodox Church, and the Russian Foreign Ministry: Collaboration or Cooptation?" *Journal of Church and State* 52 (4):712.
- Leusenko, Oleh Volodymyrovych. 2018. "Telekanal 'Inter' vidverta vidmovyvsiya vykonuvaty zakonodavstvo Ukrayiny stosochno kvot na derzhavnui movu v efiri. Vlada zoboviazana pozbavyty rupor Moskvy teleefiru." October 1. <https://petition.president.gov.ua/petition/47146>.
- Liik, Kadri, Momchil Metodiev, and Nicu Popescu. 2019. *Defender of the Faith? How Ukraine's Orthodox Split Threatens Russia*. European Council on Foreign Relations, May.
- Marples, David R. 2017. *Ukraine in Conflict: An Analytical Chronicle*. Bristol, UK: E-International Relations.
- "Meeting of the Valdai International Discussion Club." 2018. October 18. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/58848>.
- "Medvedchuk vykonuie lyshe odnu funktsiu v perehovorakh—Poroshenko." 2016. *Ukrayins'ka Pravda*, June 3. <https://www.pravda.com.ua/news/2016/06/3/7110690/>.
- "Medvedchuk ye predstavnykom Putina i z travnia ne bere uchasti u perehovorakh v Minsku—Poroshenko." 2018. TSN.ua, December 16. <https://tsn.ua/politika/medvedchuk-ye-predstavnikom-putina-i-z-travnya-ne-bere-uchasti-u-peregovorah-u-minsku-poroshenko-1266573.html>.
- "Medvedchuka do Minskoho protsesu zaluchyv ne Poroshenko, a Putin —novyi predstavnyk Ukrayiny v TKH." 2019. 5.ua, July 13. <https://www.5.ua/polityka/medvedchuka-do-minskoho-protsesu-zaluchyv-ne-poroshenko-a-putin-novyi-predstavnyk-ukrainy-v-tkh-195585.html>.
- "Medvedchuk zustrivsia z Putynem." 2019. *Ukrayins'ka Pravda*, July 18. <https://www.pravda.com.ua/news/2019/07/18/7221294/>.
- Melnik, Olena. 2019. "Holova Administratsii prezidenta Bohdan: My ne bachymo Medvedchuka peremovnykom vid Ukrayiny." *Babel'*, May 24. <https://thebabel.com.ua/news/30710-golova-administraciyi-prezidenta-bogdan-mi-ne-bachimo-medvedchuka-peremovnikom-vid-ukrajini>.
- "Miller rasskazal o snizhenii tranzita gaza cherez Ukrainu v 10 raz posle 2019 goda." 2018. April 3. <https://www.interfax.ru/business/606772>.
- Nazarchuk, Iryna. 2019. "Rishennia sudu OON pro nehaine zvlnennia Rosiieiu ukrainskykh viiskovykh moriakiv i korabliv: komentariy yurystiv." *Radio Svoboda*, May 25. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/trybunal-ukrjinski-moriaky/29962877.html>.
- Newnham, Randall. 2011. "Oil, Carrots, and Sticks: Russia's Energy Resources as a Foreign Policy Tool." *Journal of Eurasian Studies* 2 (2):134–43. doi:10.1016/j.euras.2011.03.004.
- Pashkov, Mykhailo. 2017. "Lehalizatsiia 'DNR/LNR'. Yaki motyvy i tsili putinskoho ukazu?" *Glavkom*, February 23. <http://glavcom.ua/publications/legalizaciya-dnrlnr-yaki-motivi-i-cili-putinskogo-ukazu-399764.html>.
- Pifer, Steven. 2018. "The Battle for Azov: Round 1 Goes to Russia." *Brookings Institution*, December 3. <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2018/12/03/the-battle-for-azov-round-1-goes-to-russia/>.
- Plokhy, Serhii, and Frank E. Sysyn. 2003. *Religion and Nation in Modern Ukraine*. Toronto: Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies Press.
- "Press-konferentsiia po itogam rabochego vizita v Kitai." 2019. April 27. <http://kremlin.ru/events/president/news/60396>.
- "Podviine hromadianstvo zahrozhui bezpetsi kraiiny. Biut po pasportu." 2008. *Galinfo*, August 16. [https://galinfo.com.ua/articles/podviyne\\_gromadyanstvo\\_zagrozhui\\_bezpetsi\\_kraiinybyut\\_po\\_pasportu\\_43218.html](https://galinfo.com.ua/articles/podviyne_gromadyanstvo_zagrozhui_bezpetsi_kraiinybyut_po_pasportu_43218.html)
- "Putin poobeshchal Merkel prodolzhit tranzit gaza cherez Ukrainu posle zapuska Nord Stream 2." 2018. *Interfax*, May 18. <https://www.interfax.ru/business/613319>.
- "Putin nazval uslovie dialoga s Kievom." 2019. April 7. <https://tass.ru/politika/6628706>.
- Putin, Vladimir. 2013. "Orthodox-Slavic Values: The Foundation of Ukraine's Civilisational Choice Conference." *President of Russia website*, July 27. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/18961>.
- "Putin, Medvedchuk, Khirurh, Yanukovich ... ." 2012. *Proskuriv*, July 26. <https://proskuriv.khm.gov.ua/2012/07/26/путін-медведчук-хірурх-янукович/>.
- Pivovarov, Serhii. 2018. "Rosia naroshchui viiskovi syly v Azovskomu mori vzhe pivroku." *Babel'*, November 27. [https://thebabel.com.ua/articles/22305-rosiya-naroshchuye-viiskovi-sili-v-azovskomu-mori-vzhe-pivroku-yak-ce-vidbuqvayetsya-i-chomu-konflikt-zagostrivsya-same-zaraz-poyasnyuye-golovred-blackseanews-andriy-klimenko?utm\\_source=page&utm\\_medium=relevant](https://thebabel.com.ua/articles/22305-rosiya-naroshchuye-viiskovi-sili-v-azovskomu-mori-vzhe-pivroku-yak-ce-vidbuqvayetsya-i-chomu-konflikt-zagostrivsya-same-zaraz-poyasnyuye-golovred-blackseanews-andriy-klimenko?utm_source=page&utm_medium=relevant).
- Radin, Andrew, Alyssa Demus, and Krystyna Marcinek. 2020. "Understanding Russian Subversion: Patterns, Threats, and Responses." RAND, February. [https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE300/PE331/RAND\\_PE331.pdf](https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE300/PE331/RAND_PE331.pdf).
- "Rossia nazvala uslovie prodolzeniia tranzita gaza cherez Ukrainu." 2018. *Segodnya*, March 14. <https://www.segodnya.ua/economics/enews/rossiya-nazvala-uslovie-prodolzheniya-tranzita-gaza-cherez-ukrainu-1121982.html>.
- Revealing Ukraine*. 2019. "Film Olivera Stouna pri uchastii Viktora Medvedchuka." <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fvjf36kram0&t=306s>.
- Russian Federation. 2019. "Ob oborone (s izmeneniami na 27 dekabria 2019 goda)." December 27. <http://docs.cntd.ru/document/9020348>.
- "Russian patriarch likens Kiev for Russian Orthodoxy to Jerusalem for global Christianity." 2019. TASS, January 31. <https://tass.com/society/1042662>.
- Russkaia Provoslavnaia Tserkov'. 2004. "Vystuplenie ministra inostrannykh del Rossiiskoi Federatsii I.S. Ivanova na VIII Vsemirnom Russkom Narodnom Sobore." February 3. <https://mospat.ru/archive/2004/02/6352/>.
- Savchuk, Maksym, and Natalia Sedletska. 2018. "Kto kupyy telekanal, 112 Ukraina?" *Radio Svoboda*, August 20. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/schemes/29439621.html>.
- Seddon, Max. 2019. "Putin and the Patriarchs." *Financial Times*, August 21.
- "Sered Inozemnykh Lideriv Ukrainskym naibil'she Podobayet'sya Lukashenko. Naimenshe—Putin." 2019. TSN.UA, November 11. <https://tsn.ua/ukraina/sered-inozemnih-lideriv-ukrainycam-naybilshe-podobayetsya-lukashenko-naymenshe-putin-1441344.html>.
- Sheiko, Yurii. 2019. "Yakoho prohresu Ukraina, YeS i Rosia dosiahly na hazovykh perehovorakh." *Deutsche Welle*, September 19. <https://www.dw.com/uk/якого-прогресу-україна-єс-і-росія-досягли-нагазових-переговорах/a-50504721>.
- Shevtsova, Lilia. 2014. "Ukraina—tse uliublenyi proekt Putina." March 2. <https://zbruc.eu/node/19453>.
- "Srochnaia novost dlia behzentsev iz LNR/DNR o prodlenii migrantsionnogo ucheta." 2017. *Zatulin.ru*, August 4. <https://zatulin.ru/srochnaya-novost-dlya-bezhentscev-iz-lnrnr-o-prodlenii-migrantsionnogo-ucheta/>.

- Stanovaya, Tatiana. 2019. "What the West Gets Wrong about Russia's Intentions in Ukraine." *ForeignPolicy.com*, December 6. <https://foreignpolicy.com/2019/12/06/what-the-west-gets-wrong-about-russias-intentions-in-ukraine/>.
- "Stokholmskii arbitrazh udovletvoril isk 'Naftogazu Ukrains' k 'Gazpromu' o nedostatochnykh ob'emakh tranzita." 2018. *Gordonua.com*, February 28. <http://gordonua.com/news/money/stokholmskiy-arbitrazh-udovletvoril-isk-naftogaz-ukrani-k-gazpromu-nedostatochnyh-obemah-tranzita-234124.html>.
- Szeptycki, Andrzej. 2013. *Ukraina wobec Rosji. Studium zależności*. Warsawa Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego.
- "Tatary khochut, shchob SBU pereviroly skilky rosiyskykh hromadian v Krymu." 2008. *Gazeta.ua*, September 22. [https://gazeta.ua/articles/politics/\\_tatar-hochut-schob-sbu-perevirilo-skilki-rosijskikh-gromadyan-v-krimu-/255322?mobile=true](https://gazeta.ua/articles/politics/_tatar-hochut-schob-sbu-perevirilo-skilki-rosijskikh-gromadyan-v-krimu-/255322?mobile=true).
- Topalov, Mykola. 2018a. "Naftohaz vs Hazprom: khto vyhrav bytvu pid Stokholmom." *Ekonomichna Pravda*, February 28. <https://www.epravda.com.ua/publications/2018/02/28/634557>.
- Topalov, Mykola. 2018b. "'Mertve' more: yak Rosiia znyshchui sudnoplavstvo na Azovi." *Ekonomichna Pravda*, December 4. <https://www.epravda.com.ua/publications/2018/12/4/643247>.
- "Ukrainskii natsionalist' Medvedchuk—eto khoroshii znak—Palii." 2017. *Radio Svoboda*, June 20. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/28569407.html>.
- "U Bellingcat pidtverdyly, shcho ukrainski korabli obstrilialy v mizhnarodnykh vodakh." 2018. *BBC*, December 2. <https://www.bbc.com/ukrainian/features-46418661>.
- "Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiiskoi Federatsii ot 17.07.2019 № 343 "O vnesenii izmenenii v Ukaz Prezidenta Rossiiskoi Federatsii ot 29 aprelia 2019 g. № 187 "Ob otdelnykh kategoriiakh inostrannykh grazhdan i lits bez grazhdanstva, imeishchikih pravo obratitsya s zaivleniami o prieme v grazhdanstvo Rossiiskoi Federatsii v uproshchennom poriadke." 2019. July 17. <http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/0001201907170036>.
- "U Moskvi Medvedchuk, Boiko i Rabynovych 'vidnovly' dialoh z 'Iedynou Rosiieiu.'" 2019. *Novynarnya*, July 10. <https://novynarnya.com/2019/07/10/u-moskvi-medvedchuk-boyko-i-rabinovich-vidnovili-dialog-z-yedinoyu-rosiyeyu>.
- "U Putina kazhut, shcho Medvedchuk zalyshytsia 'zviazkovym.'" 2019. *Ukrayinska Pravda*, May 20. <https://www.pravda.com.ua/news/2019/05/20/7215557/>.
- "Trystoroni konsultatsii shchodo hazu mozhut proity v druhii polovyni veresnia." 2019. *Yevropeis'ka Pravda*, June 13. <https://www.eurointegration.com.ua/news/2019/06/13/7097320>.
- "U Putina soschitali zhitelei Donbassa s rossiiskimi pasportami." 2020. *Khvylyta*, January 1. <https://khvylja.net/news/exclusive/u-putina-soschitali-zhitelj-donbassa-s-rossijskimi-pasportami-2.html>.
- Ukraine Election Task Force. 2019. "Foreign Interference in Ukraine's Democracy." May. [https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Foreign\\_Interference\\_in\\_Ukraines\\_Election.pdf](https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Foreign_Interference_in_Ukraines_Election.pdf).
- United Nations General Assembly Resolution A/73/L.47. 2018. December 17. <https://undocs.org/A/73/L.47>.
- "V Ukraini vzhe zaboronyly 73 rosiiski telekanaly." 2016. *ZN.UA*, September 7. [https://dt.ua/UKRAINE/v-ukrayini-vzhe-zaboronili-73-rosiiski-telekanali-218142\\_.html](https://dt.ua/UKRAINE/v-ukrayini-vzhe-zaboronili-73-rosiiski-telekanali-218142_.html).
- "V Kremlu pidtverdyly rehuliarni zustrichi Putina ta Medvedchuka." 2018. *TSN.ua*, November 23. <https://tsn.ua/politika/v-kremlu-pidtverdili-regulyarni-zustrichi-putina-ta-medvedchuka-1254141.html>.
- Vahner, Oleksandra. 2019. "Vid liubovi do nenavysti—odyn krok. Ukraina i Putin." *Radio Svoboda*, August 21. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/30120715.html>.
- Vinnichuk, Yurii. 2019. "Biznes Tsenzor rozbyravshia, komu z olharkhiv nalezhat naibilshi suspilno-politychni telekanaly." *Biznes Tsenzor*, June 25. [https://biz.censor.net.ua/resonance/3133637/yak\\_olgarhi\\_rozdili\\_leasefr\\_ukrani?\\_\\_cf\\_chl\\_captcha\\_tk\\_\\_=1a9ad48e4fb5eb4a6b786c0caee3d555c31c53e-1577537261-0-AW4thO\\_xGjBcpbZvXZl85ta9tYyXKCNUDSg1CUeBq6oiwNbmlbR03v9LmqCZpUVWIIfiHvOhpxZWEedd1oftSAWSgy5vV4b4l\\_o4vueTED4r-QLHAdzWXuUMoye5Nalt5m7kMdnXxzszSMAHfiIfulNQaFpj9svp2jq719jYtZwK5swxYKbu4KMMMTPl06Rwwhiu67CaKh5Lb4rQExDecEgpQeq6jWa1I\\_U\\_C86zIuojtzSsTyzw2Kxg3rC6awMfBgUsQN22ktAD4eDTr5IRehEXOAoAbHxlskZ3kiYzUiDaI51\\_3tfQswqAaRuYDRwu\\_3\\_VCSJtINh8R-A-5KZm4hbf791q0c\\_QE\\_uCXsEvh4bH5hkjuCRkOxpZ70\\_-4lyhg](https://biz.censor.net.ua/resonance/3133637/yak_olgarhi_rozdili_leasefr_ukrani?__cf_chl_captcha_tk__=1a9ad48e4fb5eb4a6b786c0caee3d555c31c53e-1577537261-0-AW4thO_xGjBcpbZvXZl85ta9tYyXKCNUDSg1CUeBq6oiwNbmlbR03v9LmqCZpUVWIIfiHvOhpxZWEedd1oftSAWSgy5vV4b4l_o4vueTED4r-QLHAdzWXuUMoye5Nalt5m7kMdnXxzszSMAHfiIfulNQaFpj9svp2jq719jYtZwK5swxYKbu4KMMMTPl06Rwwhiu67CaKh5Lb4rQExDecEgpQeq6jWa1I_U_C86zIuojtzSsTyzw2Kxg3rC6awMfBgUsQN22ktAD4eDTr5IRehEXOAoAbHxlskZ3kiYzUiDaI51_3tfQswqAaRuYDRwu_3_VCSJtINh8R-A-5KZm4hbf791q0c_QE_uCXsEvh4bH5hkjuCRkOxpZ70_-4lyhg).
- Vinokurov, Yaroslav. 2019a. "Ukraina ne kupuje haz u Hazpromu rivno 4 roky." *Hromadske*, November 26. <https://hromadske.ua/posts/ukraina-ne-kupuye-gaz-u-gazpromu-rivno-4-roki>.
- Vinokurov, Yaroslav. 2019b. "Pytannia na \$3 miliardy shchoroku: dlia choho Ukraini kontrakt z Rosiieiu pro tranzyt hazu." *Hromadske*, September 18. <https://hromadske.ua/posts/pitannya-na-dollar3-miliardi-shoroku-dlya-chogo-ukrayini-kontrakt-z-rosiyeyu-pro-tranzit-gazu>.
- "Vladimir Putin's annual news conference." 2018. December 20. <http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/59455>.
- Wawrzonek, Michał. 2014. "Ukraine in the 'Gray Zone': Between The 'Russkiy Mir' and Europe." *East European Politics and Societies and Cultures* 28 (4):758–80. doi:10.1177/0888325414543947.
- "Zaiavlenie v sviazi s situatsiei v Iuzhnoi Osetii." 2008. August 8. <http://kremlin.ru/events/president/transcripts/1042>.
- "Za 200 milioniv dollariv mozhnha staty prezidentom Ukrayiny—Oslund perepoviv rozmovu z ukrainsky ekspertom." 2018. *Radio Svoboda*, June 13. <https://www.radiosvoboda.org/a/29288136.html>.
- Zhytniuk, Oksana. 2019. "V Rosii vidkryly shche odyn punkt vydachi pasportov zhyteliam ORDLO." April 30. <https://today.ua/v-rosiyi-vidkryly-shshe-odyn-punkt-vydachi-pasportiv-zhytelyam-ordlo/>.
- Zminy do Konstytutsii pro kurs Ukrayiny na Yes i NATO nabuly chynnosti. 2019. February 21. <https://www.ukrinform.ua/rubric-politics/2644931-zminy-do-konstituciipro-kurs-na-es-i-nato-nabuli-chnosti.html>.